

9-1-1999

Excuse Me, but Is That Football Child-Free - Pakistan and Child Labour

Stephanie M. Johnson

Follow this and additional works at: <http://digitalcommons.law.utulsa.edu/tjcil>

 Part of the [Law Commons](#)

Recommended Citation

Stephanie M. Johnson, *Excuse Me, but Is That Football Child-Free - Pakistan and Child Labour*, 7 Tulsa J. Comp. & Int'l L. 163 (1999).

Available at: <http://digitalcommons.law.utulsa.edu/tjcil/vol7/iss1/6>

This Casenote/Comment is brought to you for free and open access by TU Law Digital Commons. It has been accepted for inclusion in Tulsa Journal of Comparative and International Law by an authorized administrator of TU Law Digital Commons. For more information, please contact daniel-bell@utulsa.edu.



EXCUSE ME, BUT IS THAT FOOTBALL “CHILD-FREE”? PAKISTAN AND CHILD LABOUR

Stephanie M. Johnson[†]

I. INTRODUCTION

Children playing in the park, running to catch the bus to school, simply laughing and enjoying themselves — as Americans we take these sights for granted. In America, children complain about attending school, and try their “best” to slide through geography and math class. American children rush outside to play games with their neighborhood buddies while a world away children long for the slightest bit of learning. There are children who would give up the smallest comfort to attend school on a regular basis. There are children whose only wish is to have some sort of childhood.

Many of these children yearning to learn live and work in a Pakistan community centered on the football industry.¹ In recent years, the children who worked in the football industry hand-stitched footballs in the family home.² Little hands stitched hour after hour to make a single football, leaving no time for school.³ It is not that parents do not wish to send their children to school; but they cannot afford to lose the income from the children’s stitching.⁴ One widowed mother laments, “I cannot afford to let her [daughter] go to school. We are the two main breadwinners of the family. I have four younger children to feed.”⁵ Unfortunately, this is not an isolated case. Thirty percent of Pakistan’s population lives below the poverty level, and the average per capita income is less than \$490 US

[†] B.A. Music, *Summe Cum Laude* Florida Southern College (1997); J.D. the University of Tulsa College of Law (2000).

1. See Sialkot, Pakistan, *Playing Fair and Still Winning*, THE MAGAZINE OF THE ILO: WORLD OF WORK, No. 25 June/July 1998.

2. *See id.*

3. *See id.*

4. *See id.*

5. *Id.*

value with wide gaps in the income distribution.⁶ The fact remains that in order for families to make ends meet, the children must help make the footballs. Under international pressure to end child labour, Pakistan faces a dilemma: the boycott of a product that generates \$1 billion in exports⁷ or families starving in the streets.

This comment will explain how Pakistan has dealt with this double-edged sword, and how the country is working diligently to eliminate child labour in the football industry. Part II of this paper will examine the international standard on child labour under the Convention on the Rights of the Child⁸ and the new International Labour Organization (ILO) Proposed Convention concerning the prohibition and immediate elimination of the worst forms of child labour.⁹ This section will detail Pakistan's ratification and efforts to comply with the Convention regarding child labour and current concerns regarding the new ILO treaty. Part III of this paper will discuss Pakistan's current laws and enforcement mechanisms, while Part IV will explore the unique International Programme on the Elimination of Child Labour and its success in the Pakistan football industry. Part V will conclude with suggestions for corrections in other industries.

II. INTERNATIONAL STANDARDS ON CHILD LABOUR

A. *The Convention on the Rights of the Child*

Despite the abuses of child labour in Pakistan, the country actually initiated the 1990 World Summit for Children with five other countries.¹⁰ The summit proved critical to the protection of children's rights.¹¹ Pakistan ratified the Convention on the Rights of the Child in 1990,¹² yet the problem remains enormous.

Article 32 of the Convention on the Rights of the Child deals directly with the issue of child labour:

6. See *ILO-IPEC Programme in Pakistan*, INTERNATIONAL LABOUR ORGANIZATION: IPEC IN ACTION: ASIA (visited May 25, 1999) <<http://www.ilo.org/public/english/90ipecc/action/31asia/pakist98.htm>>.

7. See *Playing Fair and Still Winning*, *supra* note 1.

8. See Convention on the Rights of the Child, U.N. Doc. 44/25 (1989).

9. See *Convention Concerning the Prohibition and Immediate Elimination of the Worst Forms of Child Labour*, INTERNATIONAL LABOUR ORGANIZATION: CHILD LABOUR, 87th Sess. (1999) [hereinafter *Prohibition and Elimination of Child Labour*].

10. See *Concluding Observations of the Committee on the Rights of the Child: Pakistan*, U.N. Doc. CRC/C/15/Add.18 (1994).

11. See *id.*

12. See Afzal Bajwa, *Government Has Done Nothing to Protect Child Rights Since 1990*, BUS. REC., May 4, 1999.

(1) States Parties recognize the right of the child to be protected from economic exploitation and from performing any work that is likely to be hazardous or to interfere with the child's education, or to be harmful to the child's health or physical, mental, spiritual, moral or social development.

(2) States Parties shall take legislative, administrative, social and educational measures to ensure the implementation of the present article...

/a/ provide for a minimum age or minimum ages for admission to employment;

/b/ provide for appropriate regulation of the hours and conditions of employment;

/c/ provide for appropriate penalties or other sanctions to ensure the effective enforcement of the present article.¹³

Pakistan submitted its State Party Report in 1993,¹⁴ and the Committee's concluding observations were less than commendable.¹⁵ Regarding child labour, the Committee was extremely alarmed at the continued exploitation of child labour in the informal and agricultural areas.¹⁶ By way of suggestion, the Committee made the following recommendations:

[t]he Committee recommends that the State party evaluate thoroughly the adequacy of measures taken to deal with issues of the exploitation of children. In the light of the legislation recently adopted in this area, namely the Employment of Children Act and the Bonded Labour System (Abolition) Act, as well as the conclusions of the Asian Regional Seminar on Children in Bondage, held in Islamabad, the Committee would like to emphasize the importance of measures to be taken for their enforcement, particularly through the establishment of complaints and inspection procedures and vigilance committees.... The Committee also recommends that greater attention be given to the issues of the employment of children in the informal sector and in agriculture and that measures be taken to address these issues....¹⁷

Pakistan also fell short in the eyes of the international community and the Committee on several other central issues, especially education.¹⁸

13. Convention on the Rights of the Child, *supra* note 8.

14. *See Initial Reports of States Parties Due in 1993: Pakistan*. U.N. Doc. CRC/C/3/Add.13 (1993).

15. *See Concluding Observations of the Committee on the Rights of the Child: Pakistan*, *supra* note 10.

16. *See id.*

17. *Id.*

18. *See id.*

These two major concerns are nearly one and the same. The Convention on the Rights of the Child in Articles 28 and 29 gives the child a right to an education.¹⁹ A child cannot attend school – even if one were accessible – if he or she must work stitching footballs, making carpets, or plowing fields. Child labour must be eradicated before education can take priority. Child labour also infringes on several other articles of the Convention on the Rights of the Child.²⁰ The Convention guarantees a child the right to high standards of health.²¹ Bleeding fingers, wounded by a slip of a stitching needle, is but one danger to a child in the work force.²² The sporting goods manufacturing is actually one of the safer industries using child labour in Pakistan.²³ Abuse is worse in both the agricultural sector and the carpet industry.²⁴ Article 31 of the Convention recognizes the right of the child to play and engage in recreational activities, as well as leisure and rest.²⁵ In Sialkot, the children do not even know how to play the game that their labour makes possible.²⁶ When reporters asked the children if they knew how to play, the young workers answered with a resounding “no” – they do not know how to play any games.²⁷ There is simply not enough time to engage in such activities when they must help their parents make ends meet.²⁸

In order to achieve the desired results, Pakistan must first take an interest in doing more than merely passing the necessary laws. Pakistan has been greatly criticized for doing nothing to protect her children.²⁹ Pakistan cannot even submit the proper reports to the Committee.³⁰ In the concluding report, the Committee requested that Pakistan submit a mid-term report due to the unsatisfactory findings.³¹ The report is over three years delinquent, and the government has made no commitment to submit a report or any indication that they intend to do so.³²

19. Convention on the Rights of the Child, *supra* note 8.

20. *See id.* at arts. 24, 28, 29, 31.

21. *See id.*

22. *See Playing Fair and Still Winning, supra* note 1.

23. *See id.*

24. *See ILO-IPEC Programme in Pakistan, supra* note 6.

25. *See* Convention on the Rights of the Child, *supra* note 8.

26. *See Playing Fair and Still Winning, supra* note 1.

27. *See id.*

28. *See id.*

29. *See Bajwa, supra* note 12.

30. *See id.*

31. *See Concluding Observations of the Committee on the Rights of the Child: Pakistan, supra* note 10; *see also* Bajwa, *supra* note 12.

32. *See Bajwa, supra* note 12.

B. Proposed Convention Concerning the Prohibition and Immediate Elimination of the Worst Forms of Child Labour

June of 1999 brings forth a new international treaty for the states parties to ratify.³³ The International Labour Organization will discuss and adopt the Convention concerning the prohibition and immediate elimination of the worst forms of child labour.³⁴ This new treaty is primarily designed to put an end to

- (a) all forms of slavery or practices similar to slavery, such as the sale and trafficking of children, forced or compulsory labour, debt bondage and serfdom;
- (b) the use, procuring or offering of a child for prostitution, for the production of pornography or for pornographic performances;
- (c) the use, procuring or offering of a child for illicit activities, in particular for the production and trafficking of drugs as defined in the relevant international treaties;
- (d) work which, by its nature or the circumstances in which it is carried out, is likely to jeopardize the health, safety or morals of children.³⁵

More than 100 countries have agreed to sign the convention once it is adopted in June at the International Labour Conference.³⁶ Pakistan, however, has a few concerns over the new convention and as of January 1999 has made no commitment to sign the treaty.³⁷ As the Convention stands, a child is defined as a person under the age of eighteen.³⁸ Pakistan would like the age limit to be left to the individual countries.³⁹ Pakistan argues that the age of eighteen may not fit the individual countries' economic, social and legal structures.⁴⁰

Pakistan has also proposed that the draft should include "corresponding obligations for the ILO or the international community, which must be in a position to assist and support countries which are already doing their best to address the problems with the limited means avail-

33. See *Prohibition and Elimination of Child Labour*, *supra* note 9.

34. See *id.*

35. See *id.*

36. See India, *Pakistan Slammed for Delaying Global Treaty on Child Labour*, AGENCE FRANCE-PRESSE, Jan. 21, 1999, available in 1999 WL 2532963 [hereinafter *Pakistan Slammed*].

37. See Ikramul Haq, *ILO meeting in June: Pakistan Wants Child Labour Age Limit be Left to Country Concerned*, BUS. REC., May 1, 1999, available in 1999 WL 14887392; see also *Pakistan Slammed*, *supra* note 36.

38. See *Prohibition and Elimination of Child Labour*, *supra* note 9.

39. See Haq, *supra* note 37.

40. See *id.*

able."⁴¹ It is the poorest countries that have the worst child labour problems, and it is obviously far more difficult to combat the problem with little or no funding. It is clear that Pakistan would like to end child labour, but the country lacks the resources to comply with even the most basic requirements under the Convention on the Rights of the Child.⁴² The added clause could, in theory, provide the much-needed assistance to countries similar to Pakistan. Only time will tell whether such a provision is even remotely feasible.

III. PAKISTAN AND CHILD LABOUR

Child labour has existed for centuries & children learning the trade of their father to carry on in the family business, children helping tend the farm, or children working to earn money for the family.⁴³ Pakistan is not vastly different than many other developing countries.⁴⁴ Cloaked in secrecy, child labour has been largely ignored by the international community until recently.⁴⁵ The upsurge of interest in eliminating child labour worldwide brought infamy to Pakistan and Pakistani products.⁴⁶ This international pressure and threat of a boycott of Pakistani exports forced Pakistan to attempt to alleviate the problem.⁴⁷

Pakistan is growing quickly and has very limited resources.⁴⁸ Most Pakistanis are illiterate, especially woman, and extremely poor.⁴⁹ Speculation blames the poor literacy rate on the government spending only 2.6% of the gross national product (GNP) on education.⁵⁰ However, plans for legislation exist to increase the amount of the GNP spent on education to 3% by the year 2000.⁵¹ There are differing statistics on the number of children exploited through child labour in Pakistan.⁵² Non-Governmental Organizations (NGOs) report a belief that half of the 23 million children in Pakistan are victims of child labour.⁵³ However, the more widely ac-

41. *Id.*

42. *See Concluding Observations of the Comm. on the Rights of the Child: Pakistan, supra* note 10.

43. *See* Majyd Aziz, *The Magnitude and Multitude of Child Labour in Pakistan*, *ECON. REV.*, July 1, 1998, available in 1999 WL 12525544.

44. *See id.*

45. *See id.*

46. *See id.*

47. *See id.*

48. *See ILO-IPEC Programme in Pakistan, supra* note 6.

49. The overall literacy rate is estimated at roughly 40%50% men and 27% women. *See id.*

50. *See id.*

51. *See id.*

52. *See id.*; *see also* Aziz, *supra* note 43.

53. In February 1999, several NGOs urged the Pakistani government to take action against

cepted figure purported by the ILO is 3.3 million children involved in child labour.⁵⁴ These children work primarily in the agricultural sector making it eight times more likely that a child living in a rural area will engage in child labour than a child in an urban area.⁵⁵ The ILO has compiled a set of statistics regarding child labour in Pakistan:

[seventy-one] per cent of working children in Pakistan are mainly in elementary unskilled occupations in agriculture, sales and services, mining, construction, manufacturing and transport. More than two-thirds of the children are working in the agricultural sector. About 70 per cent of working children are unpaid family helpers, but significant urban-rural differentials exist. In rural areas, three-fourths of the working children are unpaid family helpers, while in urban areas it is less than one-third. A good proportion of the children works 56 hours or more. Around 7 per cent of working children suffer from illnesses or injuries frequently. The majority of illnesses or injuries (71 per cent) suffered by working children were found to be in agriculture, followed by mining, construction, manufacturing and transport.⁵⁶

Pakistan has taken the initiative to pass several acts and laws to eliminate child labour.⁵⁷ Pakistan's Constitution prohibits employing anyone under the age of fourteen in mines, factories, or other hazardous occupations.⁵⁸ In subsequent legislation, Pakistan passed two acts impacting child labour % the Employment of Children Act of 1991 and the

other NGOs for defaming Pakistani products and hyping the issue of child labour in the international community. The NGOs had been accused of exaggerating statistics of child labour in the country and supporting an Anti-Pakistan agenda. These NGOs, in their zealous effort to eliminate child labour, led to the decrease in exports out of Pakistan. It is imperative that these organizations realize that Pakistan is working to eliminate the problem and that the issue of child labour that has been deeply ingrained in the Pakistani economic and social structure cannot be eliminated overnight. See Tanvir Shahzad, *Action Demanded Against NGOs Involved in Child Labour Hype*, BUS. REC., Feb. 7, 1999; see also Aziz, *supra* note 43.

54. *ILO-IPEC Programme in Pakistan*, *supra* note 6. These figures are derived from the Child Labour Survey gathered by the Federal Bureau of Statistics under the planning and implementation of the ILO office in Pakistan. Despite every scientific precaution taken, there is estimated to be more child labourers existing than the 3.3 million found in the survey. It is estimated that this number could be as high as 4 million, but certainly it is not the figure of 20 million purported by some NGOs. See Aziz, *supra* note 43.

55. See *ILO-IPEC Programme in Pakistan*, *supra* note 6.

56. *Id.*

57. The Pakistan Constitution, the Convention on the Rights of the Child, Employment of Children Act of 1991, and the Bonded Labour System (Abolition) Act of 1992. See *id.*

58. See *id.*

Bonded Labour System (Abolition) Act of 1992.⁵⁹ Pakistan has also ratified five of the seven Basic Human Rights International Labour Conventions and several other conventions that affect young workers.⁶⁰ Despite all of these international and national laws, there are still millions abused by child labour.⁶¹ This tragedy is due to both to the nature of the child labour in Pakistan and poor enforcement.⁶²

Most child labourers work in the home as family helpers and are unpaid.⁶³ The Pakistani government has no way to keep track of these children. Less than half of all children attend school, and there is no way to realistically monitor these children.⁶⁴ Parents would like to send their children to school, but they have various reasons for either allowing or making their children work.⁶⁵ When asked why, parents proffered some of the following answers:

[t]he Child Labour Survey summarized the most cogent reasons given by the parents/guardians for letting children work. The major reason given by 54% was to assist in household enterprises, while 27% said that the children worked to supplement the family income. The Survey moreover revealed that 39% of the working children are members of families that have an income within the range of Rs.2501 to Rs.4000 per month, followed by 31% in the income group from Rs. 1501 to 2500, 21% in income group from Rs.4001 and above, while the remaining 09% in income group of less than Rs. 1500.⁶⁶

Other parents were concerned about what to do with children who were neither working nor going to school.⁶⁷ Parents can barely make ends meet and certainly do not have the extra funds for childcare even if it were readily available.⁶⁸ Full-time schools would be the only potential solution, but schools are expensive, and Pakistan is poor.⁶⁹

59. *See id.*

60. The Night Work of Young Persons (Industry) Convention, 1919 (No. 6), the Minimum Age (Industry) Convention (Revised), 1937 (No. 59) and the Night Work of Young Persons (Industry) Convention (Revised), 1948 (No. 90). *See ILO-IPEC Programme in Pakistan, supra* note 6.

61. *See ILO-IPEC Programme in Pakistan, supra* note 6.

62. *See id.*

63. *See Aziz, supra* note 43.

64. *See id.*

65. *See id.*; *see also Playing Fair and Still Winning, supra* note 1.

66. *Aziz, supra* note 43.

67. *See id.*

68. *See Playing Fair and Still Winning, supra* note 1.

69. *See id.*

The Pakistani government may have implemented the necessary laws, but the enforcement mechanisms are not fully operational.⁷⁰ Majid Asiz, an author, commented on the government's outlook on enforcing these laws:

the government is still not that enthusiastic about this issue as it has been taking lenient approaches in prosecuting employers who willingly use children as workers. The government is still non-serious in providing universal education for these children and at the same time instituting a programme to supplement the loss in income of families that depend on their children for bringing in extra money for the households. The government is still lukewarm about countering the negative publicity in world media and forums regarding the Child Labour situation in Pakistan.⁷¹

Until the Pakistani government imposes the necessary sanctions on the child labour offenders and establishes a national compulsory school system, the abuses will continue. Education, if it is affordable, worthwhile, and readily available, can lead to the elimination of child labour.⁷² As the current system stands, more than half of girls and one third of boys in the age group of 5-10 years do not attend elementary schools.⁷³ Over 35,000 elementary or primary schools are either ghost schools or are without proper infrastructure.⁷⁴ Other private education efforts remain insufficient to meet the needs of the children.⁷⁵ The country lacks well-trained and dedicated teachers, or any teachers at all.⁷⁶ It is estimated that a total of 265,000 teachers will be needed in Pakistan in the coming years.⁷⁷

When the training is insufficient and it is parents are not willing to give up the income the child generates to send them to school.⁷⁸ There is also an enormous need to offer vocational training to children once they "graduate" from the primary schools.⁷⁹ Parents want their children to become skilled labourers instead of living the rest of their lives working in the same unskilled occupation.⁸⁰ Francis Blanchard, Director-General

70. See Aziz, *supra* note 43.

71. *Id.*

72. See *id.*

73. See *id.*

74. See *id.*

75. See Aziz, *supra* note 43.

76. See *id.*

77. See *id.*

78. See *id.*

79. See *id.*

80. See Aziz, *supra* note 43.

of the ILO, once wrote "Child labour is embedded in poverty and it is thru [sic] sustained increase in standards of living that it will be abolished...."⁸¹ If the children are trained in a profession, the quality of their work will be higher, and in turn, they will be paid better wages for the better made products.⁸² This could potentially end the vicious cycle of child labour and poverty in Pakistan.⁸³

IV. PROGRESS IN THE FOOTBALL INDUSTRY

Stitch, stitch, stitch % monotonous long days in a poorly lit room can be detrimental to the physical and mental development of children.⁸⁴ Before recent developments, most footballs were made, not in factories, but in homes.⁸⁵ Families received a certain amount for each football stitched.⁸⁶ Logically and economically, families receive more money the more footballs produced.⁸⁷ Struggling to feed family members and make ends meet, parents coerce, pressure, and more likely than not demand children to stitch footballs to earn money for the family % oftentimes, forcing the child to forgo any chance of a formal or informal education.⁸⁸ Fortunately, this situation is becoming increasingly uncommon.⁸⁹ The football stitching industry has made the most substantial strides in eliminating child labour of all the industries that utilize child workers.⁹⁰ International outrage at the conditions described above and threat of a boycott of Pakistani footballs in the World Cup, convinced the Sialkot region to take significant steps to eradicate child labour in the industry by signing a Memorandum of Understanding (MOU) with the ILO, the United Nations Children's Education Fund (UNICEF), and Save the Children-UK in Atlanta in 1997.⁹¹ This MOU started a unique programme in Pakistan coordinated by the International Programme on the Elimination of Child Labour (IPEC) and funded by a wide array of sources.⁹²

81. *Id.*

82. See *Pakistan Making Progress in Eliminating Child Labour*, DEUTSCHE PRESSE-AGENTUR, April 30, 1999.

83. See *id.*

84. See *id.*

85. See *Playing Fair and Still Winning*, *supra* note 1.

86. See *id.*

87. See *id.*

88. See *id.*

89. See *id.*

90. See *Playing Fair and Still Winning*, *supra* note 1.

91. See *id.*

92. Funding for the project is provided as follows: ILO-IPEC funds, amounting to over US \$755,700, are provided by the United States Department of Labour; Pakistan Bait-ul-Mal has committed an additional amount of about US \$195,000 towards the ILO's Social Protec-

This programme is voluntary for manufacturers in the football industry.⁹³ Of the 70 manufacturing companies in the Sialkot region,⁹⁴ 34 have joined the programme, accounting for 70% of the footballs exported from the region. The programme has taken the stitching out of the homes and put it in stitching "centers" that are monitored by the IPEC monitoring team.⁹⁵ The monitoring team randomly visits the centres to make sure that no children are involved in the making of the footballs.⁹⁶ If a child is found in the stitching centre, the supervisor of the centre is sanctioned, and the parents of the child are told to send their children to one of the learning centres, which are also part of the program.⁹⁷ The monitoring team on one trip found only one child under the age of 14, and that child was stitching an UMBR[®]O brand football.⁹⁸

Two manufacturers have modern factories that the IPEC team monitors, which are equivalent to the village stitching centres.⁹⁹ These centres can account for every football made to ensure a child-free product.¹⁰⁰ These facilities lend credibility in the international community that the footballs are actually produced without the use of child labour and are the "wave of the future" for Pakistani football production.¹⁰¹ Mid 1999 is the scheduled time to have all the footballs in Sialkot produced in stitching centres.¹⁰² Rijk van Haarlem, a member of the monitoring team, commented on this last phase of the project: "[I]t's the last phase which [sic] is going to be the toughest. To date, our monitors have only found 91 children in the stitching centres. All the rest are older."¹⁰³ This is a vast improvement in the process to eliminate child labour in Pakistan.

tion and Rehabilitation programme of the project; UNICEF's contribution is US \$200,000; The Sialkot Chamber of Commerce and Industry (SCCI) is contributing US \$250,000 towards the project's Prevention and Monitoring Programme; Save the Children - UK has a commitment of about US \$900,000 from the British Department for International Development's bilateral programme funds; The Soccer Industries Council of America (SICA) and (FIFA) have provided US \$100,000 each towards the project; As a token of the commitment of Pakistani workers to the cause of elimination of child labour in Pakistan, The All Pakistan Federation of Trade Unions (APFTU) has made a contribution of US \$1,000 to the Sialkot project. *See id.*

93. *See id.*

94. Sialkot produces roughly 75% of the footballs produced in Pakistan. *See Playing Fair and Still Winning, supra* note 1.

95. *See id.*

96. *See id.*

97. *See id.*

98. *See id.*

99. *See Playing Fair and Still Winning, supra* note 1.

100. *See id.*

101. *See id.*

102. *See id.*

103. *See id.*

Another integral part of the programme is the implementation of over 90 rehabilitation centres that provide the children with an informal education so that when the full-time education system becomes effective, the transition will not be overly difficult.¹⁰⁴ The rehabilitation centres provide an informal education and give medical attention.¹⁰⁵ Mr. van Haarlem further commented on the progress of the rehabilitation centres: "[a]bout 2,000 are in the special rehabilitation programme. That means around 4,900 children are still missing. It's pretty obvious that they are still working from home and it's going to be a hard task to remove such labour from the chain of production."¹⁰⁶ Despite the seemingly depressing number of missing children, it is important to understand the 2,000 children are no longer injuring their tiny hands with thick football stitching needles.¹⁰⁷ These children are gaining knowledge and their families are being better paid by the industry – again, substantial improvement above the status quo in other industries.¹⁰⁸

Select Sports, a Dutch firm, and a Sialkot sporting goods manufacturer are taking another initiative.¹⁰⁹ This five-part programme provides health and education facilities to the families who stitch their footballs without utilizing child labour.¹¹⁰ The first part of this unique programme provides a subsidy in two installments to parents of children who already attend school to cover expenses to make sure that they do not drop out.¹¹¹ Secondly, it provides an informal education to those children between the ages of 8 and 14 who have never attended regular school.¹¹² The third part provides an informal education to those above the age of 14 who had to drop out of school to work.¹¹³ The elimination of adult illiteracy through further informal education comprises the fourth part.¹¹⁴ Finally, the fifth step will establish a vocational training facility for young people.¹¹⁵ This and the IPEC programme are wonderful and effective programmes that other industries should implement to further eliminate child labour in Pakistan and around the world. Because these programmes have worked so well, the European Union¹¹⁶ has decided not to sanction Pakistan and

104. See *Playing Fair and Still Winning*, *supra* note 1.

105. See *id.*

106. See *id.*

107. See *Pakistan Making Progress in Eliminating Child Labour*, *supra* note 82.

108. See *id.*

109. See Aziz, *supra* note 43.

110. See *id.*

111. See *id.*

112. See *id.*

113. See *id.*

114. See Aziz, *supra* note 43.

115. See *id.*

116. The E.U. is Pakistan's largest trading partner. They account for one-third of Pakistan's

will even renew its trade agreement with the country, including possible incentives for child-free products.¹¹⁷

V. CONCLUSION

Strides are being made all over Pakistan for the elimination of child labour.¹¹⁸ Although the country still has many problems, some of the solutions currently being used in the country can be transferred to different industries.¹¹⁹ For example, the carpet industry, also fallen prey to international pressure, has implemented a program to potentially insure carpet buyers that the carpet is "child-free."¹²⁰ The "Rugmark" allegedly denotes that the carpet was made without benefit of child labour.¹²¹ Carpet makers who wish the label to appear on their carpets must become certified.¹²² Certification requires a manufacturer to produce "child-free" carpets, pay at least minimum wages to their employees, and agree to submit to unannounced inspections.¹²³ The label comes with a self-imposed surcharge that goes toward rehabilitation and education of former child workers.¹²⁴ This sort of scheme could work in nearly all industries that utilize child labour, and will in fact expand to include apparel and footwear.¹²⁵ Furthermore, techniques like those used in the football industry can serve as a cross over to the surgical instruments industry as well as others.¹²⁶ The concepts are not all that new % monitoring and imposing the appropriate sanctions. They just need to be used in all countries that "allow" child labour.

The largest problem exists where there are no products to export or a factory to inspect. Most child labourers work in rural areas in the agricultural area.¹²⁷ These children fall through the cracks of the laws and the monitoring systems.¹²⁸ Pakistan needs to work to free these children of

exports and one-fifth of imports. See *E.U. Will Not Impose Child Labour Sanctions on Pakistan*, DEUTSCHE PRESSE-AGENTUR, April 9, 1999; see also *European Union Offers to Lower Import Tariff if Employment Criteria Are Met and Child Labour Abolished*, BUS. REC., March 16, 1999.

117. See *E.U Will Not Impose Child Labour Sanctions on Pakistan*, *supra* note 116.

118. See Aziz, *supra* note 43.

119. See *id.*

120. See *id.*

121. See *id.*

122. See *id.*

123. See Aziz, *supra* note 43.

124. See *id.*

125. See *id.*

126. See *id.*

127. See *id.*

128. See Aziz, *supra* note 43.

the bonds of child labour. The key to doing this is education. There cannot be enough emphasis on the importance of schooling for these children. With the implementation of a national, respectable school system, parents will be more willing to let their child out of the field and into the classroom to be trained for better work that will bring the family more money.¹²⁹ Education is the key to success in ending child labour in Pakistan and other developing countries. Innovative programs like the ones in the football industry do an effective job of combining education for elimination.¹³⁰ Those are the success stories. There can be more & many more.

129. See *Pakistan Making Progress in Eliminating Child Labour*, *supra* note 82.

130. See *id*; see also *Playing Fair and Still Winning*, *supra* note 1.